

GARFF PARISH DISTRICT COMMISSIONERS
Monthly Meeting at Commissioners' Offices, 35 New Road, Laxey

Meeting Minutes

Wednesday 17th July 2019 7.00 pm

Present: Mr J. Smith (JS) (Vice-Chair), Mr N. Dobson (ND), Mr. T Kenyon (TK),
Mr P. Kinnish (PK), Mr. J. Quayle, Mr L. Miller (LM),
Mr A. Moore (AM).
In Attendance: Mr P. Burgess, Clerk, Mr M. Royle, Deputy Clerk/RFO, Mrs J. Mattin, Housing Manager
Apologies: Mrs M. Fargher (Chair), Mrs J. Pinson (JP).

In Private
7.00 pm

Meeting with Mr Gordon Clarke in regard to a planning application at a property in Lonan.
JS welcomed Mr Gordon Clark to the meeting. Mr Clark briefed the Commissioners in regard to relevant personal matters relating to a forthcoming planning application at Skinscoe Farm in Lonan.

In Public
7.20 pm

*Presentation from '5G Aware IOM'.
JS Welcomed Stefanie Kirwan and Suzanne Young from the '5G Aware IOM' organisation to the meeting. Ms. Kirwan addressed the meeting and thanked the Commissioners for inviting the organisation to speak to Members. She advised that she had professional qualifications in the area of Health Science including degrees and onward diplomas. Ms Kirwan advised that she was a health practitioner who worked with clients who had 'electro hyper sensitivity. She expressed concerns with the manner of the government's moves to digital technology. The planning application made by Sure Telecommunications for a replacement mast close to the Albert Tower in Maughold was referenced. Ms. Kirwan expressed disappointment with the stance of the Isle of Man's Director of Public Health as expressed both in regard to this application and to the issue of 5G technology in general. Ms. Kirwan felt that a growing body of evidence was being ignored by health professionals who advised governments in these matters. She advised that, in her opinion, ICNERP (the international body who controlled the telecommunications industry) had questionable links to the industry.
Ms. Kirwan was concerned that the new 5G technology posed an even greater threat to the public from EMF radiation as it necessitated the siting of many 'satellite' masts on lampposts and other fixtures in suburban streets, close to houses and in the midst of the population. 5G technology relied on transmission of radio waves at a much higher frequency; the effects of this being an aspect which Ms. Kirwan felt had not been adequately researched. She felt that implementation of the technology was being driven by the telecommunications industry and that governments were permitting and enabling roll out of 5G without effective scrutiny and regard for public safety. She asserted that further research was necessary and that the 'precautionary principle' should be applied until it were proven that 5G caused no threat to human health. Ms. Kirwan expressed disappointment in the engagement of Members of Tynwald in the debate. Her organisation had written to MHKs but had only received 4 responses.
Ms. Kirwan asked if the Commissioners could appeal the approval for a replacement mast at the Albert Tower. MR advised that the Commissioners had considered that application on material planning grounds which were largely restricted to visual impact. The campaign against 5G had not gathered momentum at the initial planning stage and the Commission had only been contacted by '5G Aware IOM' several weeks after the approval decision and in the last few days before the expiration of the 21 day period in which an appeal can be lodged. Garff Commissioners had immediately re-engaged with the application, and began analysing information from a wide range of sources. The comments of the Director of Public Health and the Planning Officer were noted in their considerations. In the short time available, the*

	<p><i>Commission had not formed an opinion, but nonetheless requested an extension of the 21 day appeal period from the Planning Directorate and Cabinet Office. The request for an extension was declined as the 21 day period is a legal requirement. Subsequently, Garff Commissioners had lodged a freedom of Information request to ascertain if there had been any previous extensions to this 21 day period. In this period, the Commission had also contacted Ramsey Commissioners on several occasions, but had only received acknowledgements; no assessment or viewpoint on the matter has ever been received by Garff Commissioners from Ramsey Commissioners.</i></p> <p><i>Ms. Young referred to the current consultation on the Telecommunications Development Order. She advised that the documents in regard to this consultation made no mention of safety. This was noted by Members. Ms. Kirwan asked if Members could consider all she had said in her presentation for the sake of residents. She asked if the Commissioners could submit a petition of doleance in regard to 5G technology. Ms. Young closed the presentation by stating that it must be proven that 5G is safe before it is implemented.</i></p> <p><i>JS congratulated '5G Aware IOM' on raising awareness of the issue and thanked Ms. Kirwan and Ms. Young for attending to brief the Commissioners.</i></p> <p><i>Ms. Kirwan and Ms Young left the meeting at 7.57 pm.</i></p>	
7.30 pm	Public Session	
131/19	Planning Matters	
	Planning Applications	
a)	<p>19/00695/B Site Near To Glen Callam House, Dhoon Loop Road, Erection of bottling plant shed and water storage tanks.</p> <p><i>JQ expressed concern that the information included with this application was inadequate particularly in terms of measures in regard to environmental impacts and public health. Concerns were also expressed in terms of industrialisation of this rural area. In these circumstances the Commission resolved to object to the application.</i></p>	
b)	<p>19/00710/B 25 Ard Reayrt, Laxey, Installation of flue.</p> <p><i>There were no objections to these proposals.</i></p>	
c)	<p>19/00727/B 3 Cooil Ushtey, Port Lewaigue, Erection of extension to provide garage with terrace above.</p> <p><i>There were no objections to these proposals.</i></p>	
d)	<p>19/00542/B The Firs Rencell Hill, Laxey, Alterations, erection of extension to form ancillary accommodation and creation of retaining walls (Amended Plans).</p> <p><i>There were no objections to these amendments.</i></p>	
	Approval Notices (DEFA Planning Committee)	
e)	<p>19/00187/B Thallo Queen Cottage, Glen Mona Loop Road, Alterations and erection of rear extension – Approved 11.07.19. <i>This approval was noted. No further instruction.</i></p>	
f)	<p>19/00553/B Upper Rhenab, Rhenab Road, Cornaa, Erection of a replacement dwelling – Approved 02.07.19. <i>This approval was noted. No further instruction.</i></p>	
g)	<p>19/00565/B Rockwood, Land Adjacent To Ramsey Road, Laxey, Erection of a roof canopy/gazebo/walled area _ Approved 02.07.19. <i>This approval was noted. No further instruction.</i></p>	
h)	Refusal Notices (DEFA Planning Committee) - ntr	
i)	Appeal Notices (DEFA Planning Committee) - ntr	
	Other Planning Matters - ntr	
132/19	Approval of Minutes	
a)	<p>Approval of minutes of meeting 3rd of July 2019.</p> <p><i>These were agreed to be an accurate record of the discussions and decisions made. Proposed, ND. Seconded, JQ. Resolved.</i></p>	
133/19	Matters Arising & Other Business	
a)	To discuss the future of the Beach/Changing Huts on Laxey Promenade.	

	<p><i>It was noted that two parties had approached the Commissioners with a view to leasing the current building on a commercial basis. This was one option that the Commissioners were considering along with refurbishment, demolition, demolition with a re-build, etc. It was felt that consideration of a commercial lease option should be explored further at this stage. It was agreed that both parties should be requested to submit written proposals indicating how they would make use of the building for consideration at the meeting on the 7th of August 2019. Members felt that this would assist in clarifying the viability of the option to lease commercially. It was noted that if this option were ultimately favoured requests for 'Expressions of Interest' would have to be advertised publically through a formal tender process.</i></p>	
<p>b)</p>	<p>To discuss proposals from the Glen Road Sub-Committee for refurbishment/development of the Glen Road Recreation Area. Please note the following motions which will be put by ND:</p> <p>ND summarised the proposals that the Glen Road Sub-Committee had brought forward which were outlined in brief in the two motions he had put before the Board. There followed discussion of the viability of the sports hall option. AM stated that the initial costings demonstrated that a sports hall involved a huge amount of money. ND felt that the proposal for a sports hall was very worthy of investigation, advising that a full business case would need to be produced. He was confident that the viability of the option could be proven. In support of this he referred to the success of the 'Tommy Clucas' sports hall in Peel. JQ expressed support for the proposal to investigate the sports hall option as he felt it could provide a facility for all ages. Several Members referred to the proposals for new sports halls in Braddan and Ramsey. PK expressed a view that the area was well served with facilities 7/8 miles away at the NSC. Other Members referred to the proposals for sports halls in Braddan and Ramsey. There followed discussion of other related matters including flood risk, mitigation of visual intrusion, loss of current amenity (recycling area, grassed areas, outdoor tennis court, etc. It was also noted that the most popular facility requested in the survey was a dedicated skate-park.</p> <p>The option of refurbishment/improvement of current facilities was also discussed. This would include a new fence for the tennis courts, an all-weather surface for the current MUGA, and fixed skate-park equipment.</p> <p>There followed discussion of the participation of PK in the vote as he was a Committee Member of Laxey Football Club. It was noted that this constituted a personal interest rather than a pecuniary interest. AM asked if LM & TK who had been appointed to the Laxey and Lonan Sports and Communities Facilities Charity could be considered to have a similar interest. MR suggested that there was a difference between the two situations as LM & TK had been appointed to the L&LSCF to represent the Garff Board. MR advised that the Board could defer the vote until further clarification had been obtained. JS considered these matters and advised that he would allow the motions to be put and votes taken with the Members present as he wished to maintain a quorum and did not feel PK's interest would be prejudicial.</p> <p>The first motion was put by ND:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To approve the expenditure of up to £20K to further investigate the feasibility of a Sports Hall and Skate park facility, if the site can accommodate both. This was seconded by JQ. For: 2. Against: 4. (Chair abstained). The motion did not carry. <p>The second motion was put by ND:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To approve the expenditure of between £3.5K and £5K to further investigate the refurbishment of the existing Multi use games area and single tennis court and investigate the feasibility of building a skate park facility. This was seconded by LM. For: 5. Against: 0. Abstentions: 1 (inc. Chair). 	

	<i>This motion was carried. The clerks were instructed to make arrangements for the execution of these matters.</i>	clerks
c)	<p>Cooil Roi – Out of Hours on call service.</p> <p>ND introduced this motion indicating that the Board were aware of concerns expressed by some residents of the complex in regard to alternative 'out of hours' cover. He advised that the pilot scheme would allow assessment of the feasibility and cost efficiency of an alternative system from a provider used by other local authorities.</p> <p>The Following motion was put by ND:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To approve a pilot scheme for out of hours on call service using Appello for a 6 month period, during which time current Warden rotas to be maintained. <p>This was seconded by AM. For: 5. Against: 0. Abstentions: 1 (inc. Chair).</p> <p>The clerks were instructed to make arrangements for the execution of these matters.</p>	clerks
d)	<p>To discuss the Consultation on the 'Telecommunications Development Order' (link: https://consult.gov.im/cabinet-office/telecommunications-development-order/).</p> <p>Matter deferred from the meeting on 03.07.19.</p> <p>A discussion took place. JQ stated that the new proposals appeared more restrictive than the current order, particularly in terms of the need to apply for planning permission for a mast: in the 2013 Order a mast up to 15m is permitted without a planning application, whereas the draft 2019 Order this height is reduced to 12m. In these circumstances the Board agreed that they had no objection to the new draft Permitted Development Orders.</p> <p>There followed a discussion of Interested Party Status. It was noted that IPS would not be granted if the party's property was more than 20 metres away from the application site boundary.</p>	
e)	<p>To Note: Freedom of Information Request made by the Commissioners into the number of extensions to the 21 day period following a planning decision notice – the time period for requesting an appeal. The request also asked for reasons for any extensions and their length.</p> <p><i>This was noted.</i></p>	
134/19	General correspondence	
a)	Cabinet Office – Invitation to attend the 'Pre-Inquiry' meeting in regard to the Draft Area Plan for the East. Correspondence also includes a form to register for attendance at the Public Inquiry which commences on the 10 th of September 2019.	
b)	Isle of Man Gran Fondo – Regarding road closures for cycling event (the event does not pass through Garff, but does affect other areas of the Island).	
c)	Cabinet Office – Information from the IOM Government Preservation of War Memorials Committee.	
d)	IOM Police – Invitation to meet with Stephen Maddocks, Superintendent for all Policing Operations (<i>Commissioners to suggest possible dates</i>)	
135/19	Committee Reports – by exception	
136/19	Officers Report	
	Officers' Report (New Road Matters)	
	Officer's Report (Cooil Roi Matters) (<i>Report to be circulated</i>)	
137/19	Health and Safety (<i>Report circulated 12.07.19</i>)	
138/19	Works and Amenities <i>Report circulated 12.07.19</i>)	
139/19	Financial Matters – (<i>Report to be circulated</i>).	
140/19	Staffing Matters – ntr	
	Chairman's Report – ntr	

141/19	Any Other Business	
a)	DEE – Meetings to initiate a 'Branding' initiative for Laxey Village. MR reported that the DEE had been approached and they had agreed hold a meeting on 22 nd August, 7pm at Laxey Working Mens Institute.	
142/19	Matters in Private	
a)	<i>Matters arising from discussions with the Laxey & Lonan Heritage Trust. Were discussed.</i>	
b)	ND reported on decisions made by the Employment Sub-Committee in regard to the appointment of an Administrative Assistant and a 'retained' HR Provider.	
c)	Quotations for the installation of CCTV equipment at the Cooil Roi Sheltered Housing Complex were received.	
	Meeting Closed at 9.55pm Date of next meeting:- 7 th August 2019	